INTEGRATING ACADEMIC AND STUDENT AFFAIRS:
Promoting Student Success through the Curriculum & Co-Curriculum

Joe Cuseo
Professor Emeritus, Psychology; Educational Consultant, AVID for Higher Education
jcuseo@earthlink.net

Kentucky Council on Postsecondary Education
Kentucky Student Success Summit

Louisville, KY
April 15th, 2013
Developing a Common Vocabulary: Key Operational Definitions

1. **Student Learning**: an enduring change (positive development) in a student that results from environmental experience (e.g., the college experience).

   Student learning may be manifested through positive change manifested in three major ways: affective, behavioral, or cognitive—which may be summarized by an “ABC” mnemonic:

   - **A** = **A**ffective: change in attitude, motivation, values, interests, feelings or emotions.

   - **B** = **B**ehavioral: change in actions, habits, skills, competencies or proficiencies.

   - **C** = **C**ognitive: change in knowledge, level of thinking, or conceptual perspective.

2. **Student Development**: student change or growth with respect to any dimension of the self that results from the college experience.

   ![Diagram of Holistic Development](image)
Major Elements/Components of Holistic (“Whole Person”) Learning and Development

- **Intellectual (Cognitive) Development**: increased breadth and depth of knowledge, learning how to learn and how to think at a higher level.

- **Personal Development**: coherent self-concept, personal identity, and self-direction; stronger sense of self-efficacy, and civic responsibility

- **Emotional Development**: increased capacity to cope with, control, and express emotions effectively (i.e., emotional intelligence).

- **Social Development**: improved ability to form and sustain meaningful interpersonal relationships.

- **Physical Development**: acquisition and application of knowledge to prevent disease, preserve wellness, and promote peak performance.

- **Vocational (Occupational) Development**: heightened awareness of career options; crystallization of an initial career choice that is compatible with one’s interests, talents, needs and values; development of skills needed for lifelong career success.

- **Ethical (Character) Development**: acquiring a clear value system for guiding life choices and personal decisions, and developing consistency between moral convictions (beliefs) and moral commitments (actions).

- **Spiritual Development**: developing an appreciation for introspection and the capacity to contemplate about the meaning or purpose of life, and a willingness to explore ideas that transcend the physical or material world.

(For more specific learning outcomes associated with each of these elements of holistic development, see the Appendix A, p. 10)

3. **Education**: an inclusive learning process that embraces both academic learning through the curriculum and experiential learning through the co-curriculum.

- **The Curriculum**: all classroom-based learning experiences explicitly related to academic courses.

- **The Co-Curriculum**: all out-of-class learning experiences that are not explicitly related to academic courses.

- **Academic Learning**: vicarious learning related to classroom-based experiences that are formally tied to the college curriculum.

- **Experiential Learning**: learning directly from personal experiences that take place outside the classroom and are not formally tied to the college curriculum.

For thoughts about the role of all support staff as potential experiential educators, see Appendix B, p. 11.
Unifying Campus Culture through Development & Use of Common Language

A Common Language for Student Success:

1. **Personal Validation**—student success is fostered when students feel personally significant—i.e., when they are recognized as individuals, feel like they matter to the institution, and believe that the institution cares about them as whole persons (Rendón, 1994; Schlossberg, Lynch, & Chickering, 1989; Terenzini, et al., 1996).

2. **Self-Efficacy**—students are more likely to be successful when they believe their personal effort matters—when they think they can exert significant influence or control over the outcomes of their education, their life, and their future (Bandura, 1997; Chemers, Hu, & Garcia, 2001; Csikszentmihalyi, 1990; Elias, & Loomis, 2002; Multon, Brown, & Lent, 1991).

3. **Meaning & Purpose**—students are more likely to succeed when they find meaning, purpose, and relevance in their college experience—i.e., when they see connections between what they’re learning in college, their current life, and their future goals (Ausubel, 1978; Fink, 2002; Mezirow, 2000; Nash & Murray, 2010; Palmer, 2000; Parks, 2000; Ryan & Deci, 2000; Wlodkowski, 1998).

4. **Active Involvement (Engagement)**—student success increases proportionately with the depth of student involvement in the learning process, i.e., the amount of time and energy they invest in the college experience, both inside and outside the classroom (Astin, 1993; Kuh, 2001; Kuh, et al., 2005; McKeachie, et al., 1986; Pascarella & Terenzini, 1991, 2005).

5. **Reflection**—students are more likely to be successful when they reflect on their college and life experiences, elaborate on them and transform them into a form that connects with what they already know or have previously experienced (Bruner, 1990; Ewell, 1997; Flavell, 1985; Svinicki, 2004; Vygotsky, 1978).

6. **Social Integration**—retention and learning are enhanced through social interaction, collaboration, and the formation of interpersonal relationships between students and other members of the college community—peers, faculty, staff, and administrators (Astin, 1993; Bruffee, 1993; Johnson, Johnson, & Smith, 1998; Slavin, 1996; Tinto, 1993).

7. **Self-Awareness**—students are more likely to experience success when they gain deeper awareness of themselves and become more mindful of their learning strategies, styles, habits, and modes of thinking (Buckingham & Clifton, 2001; Langer, 1997; Pintrich, 1995; Weinstein & Meyer, 1991; Weinstein & Underwood, 1985).
A Common Language for Successful Educational Programs

1. **INTENTIONAL (PURPOSEFUL):** The program is deliberately designed and delivered with research-based principles of student success in mind, namely:
   - Personal Validation.
   - Self-Efficacy.
   - Meaning & Purpose.
   - Active Involvement (Engagement).
   - Reflection.
   - Social Integration, and
   - Self-Awareness.

2. **STUDENT-CENTERED:** The program is centered on and driven by the educational needs and personal welfare of students, rather than by institutional habit or convenience, or by the self-serving needs and preferences of faculty, administrators, or staff.

3. **MISSION-DRIVEN:** The program is grounded in and guided by a well-articulated program mission that is consistent with the college or university mission.

4. **INTRUSIVE:** The program is not simply offered on a come-find-and-use basis—waiting and hoping that students will discover and capitalize on it (“passive programming”); instead, supportive action is initiated by the institution by actively reaching out to students and bringing the program to them, thereby ensuring that support reaches students who are unlikely to seek it out on their own.

5. **PROACTIVE:** The program is delivered in a way that takes early, preventative action to address students’ learning needs and developmental adjustments in an anticipatory fashion—before they eventuate in problems that require reactive (after-the-fact) intervention.

6. **DIVERSIFIED:** The program is tailored or customized to meet the distinctive needs of different student subpopulations (first-year students, underrepresented students, transfer students, etc.).

7. **COMPREHENSIVE (HOLISTIC):** The program addresses the student as a “whole person,” addressing the multiple dimensions of self that affect student success (social, emotional, physical, etc.).

8. **DEVELOPMENTAL:** The program is delivered in a timely, stage-sensitive sequence that helps students accommodate challenges as they emerge at successive phases or stages of their college experience; in so doing, it promotes student growth by providing a “scaffold” that balances challenge with just-in-time support for students when they are most “ready” to receive it.

9. **COLLABORATIVE:** The program embraces cooperative alliances or partnerships between different organizational units of the college/university that work together in a complementary and interdependent manner, harnessing their collective power to exert synergistic (multiplicative) effects on student success.

10. **SYSTEMIC:** The program occupies a central (rather than a peripheral or marginal) place on campus, which positions it to exert pervasive effects on the student body and a transformative effect on the institution itself.

11. **DURABLE:** The program is institutionalized—i.e., it’s built into the institution’s table of organization and annual budget process, thus ensuring its longevity and its capacity to exert perennial impact on successive cohorts of students for years to come.

12. **EMPIRICAL (EVIDENTIARY):** The program is supported by assessment data (both quantitative and qualitative) that are used for summative evaluation—to “sum up” and prove the program’s overall impact or value, and formative evaluation—to “shape up” and continually improve program quality.
Caveats:
1. Consciously avoid language to describe student development programming that may have “non-academic” connotations.

Examples:
* Student development programs rather than student “activities”—which may connote the ideas of fun ‘n’ games

* Co-curricular vs. “extracurricular”—which may connote a peripheral “side show” that’s only loosely related to the institution’s central educational purpose

* Student Development Office vs. Office of Student “Affairs” or Student “Services”—the former may connote a custodial administrative/managerial function and the latter suggests a strictly “customer service” model (rather than a student learning model).

2. When advertising a student development program or co-curricular event, intentionally articulate and communicate its educational objective or intended learning outcome.

------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Unifying Campus Culture through Development & Use of Common Educational Practices, Customs, & Artifacts

* Create co-curricular programs and products that parallel those found in the formal curriculum.

For example:

1. Co-Curricular Syllabus (comparable to the traditional course syllabus) that provides one-page outline of the co-curricular event’s learning objectives, content, and process of educational delivery.

2. Co-Curricular Assessment—e.g., students write a one-minute paper after experiencing a co-curricular program or event, which asks them to evaluate the experience in terms of how it contributed to their learning or development—particularly with respect to its intended educational outcome(s).
   (For a sample of higher-level thinking questions that can be used for one-minute papers, see Appendix C.

3. Co-Curricular Schedule (comparable to the schedule of classes issued each term) that contains the titles, dates, times, and brief descriptions of co-curricular events to be offered during the semester.
   Note: Ideally, this co-curricular events schedule would be attached to, or included as a separate section within the traditional schedule of classes.
4. Co-Curricular Catalogue (comparable to the traditional course catalogue) that contains:
- a mission statement for the co-curriculum
- educational goals and objectives of the co-curriculum
- annually offered programs and activities
- names and educational background of student development and student-service professionals.

Note: Ideally, this co-curricular catalogue would be incorporated within the traditional college catalogue as a special, clearly identifiable subsection.

5. Co-Curricular or Student Development Transcript (comparable to the traditional registrar-issued transcript of completed courses) that formally lists and documents students’ co-curricular achievements—both for personal recognition and for future student use when applying to career positions or graduate schools.

Note: Ideally, this co-curricular transcript would be incorporated within or appended to the student’s course transcript.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Creating a Unified Culture through Organizational Structures that Stimulate & Sustain Cross-Divisional Partnerships

1. Capitalize on naturally occurring or already existing cross-divisional “intersection points”—i.e., cross-functional areas where Academic and Student Affairs crisscross with respect to program administration or delivery.

For example:
* New-student orientation (Student Affairs) and convocation (Academic Affairs)
* First-year seminar (“extended” first-year orientation course) taught by faculty and student development professionals who received joint training
* Academic advising (intersecting with career counseling and personal counseling)
* Practicums, internships, volunteer (service-learning) experiences
* Residential life-based academic programming (e.g., “living-learning” experiences such as tutoring or academic advising conducted in student residences)
* Transitional programming for graduating students—e.g., sophomore-year courses/programs for community college students transferring to 4-year institutions; senior-year seminars/programs for 4-year college students transitioning to careers or graduate school.

2. Incorporate courses into the curriculum that integrate student development theory with academic learning.
Examples: first-year experience course; service-learning courses; senior/sophomore seminar; interdisciplinary courses with experiential components; leadership development course).
3. Create structured opportunities for Academic and Student Affairs professionals to collaborate on campus issues (e.g., task forces, ad hoc committees, or joint research projects to address topics of mutual interest and concern—such as accreditation, assessment, and/or student retention).

4. Organize discussion groups or “critical-moment learning teams” of faculty and student affairs professionals after a high-impact event or critical incident has taken place on campus (e.g., racial incident or student suicide).

5. Arrange office locations that intentionally place faculty members and Student Affairs professionals within physical proximity of each other—to increase the likelihood of dialogue, interaction, and potential collaboration.

6. Arrange for temporary exchanges of Academic & Student Affairs professionals who may be willing to “crossover” to another division of the college and gain an expanded perspective (e.g., via reassigned time, internal sabbatical, or temporary positional exchange).

7. Create administrative positions that involve integration of Academic & Student Affairs responsibilities (e.g., Director of the First-Year Experience; Coordinator of Student Success; Dean of Student Learning).

Creating a Collaborative Campus Culture through Intentional Recruitment, Orientation, Development, & Reward Strategies

1. Intentionally recruit and select faculty members who have an interest in and commitment to student development (e.g., via intentional position announcements, interview questions, and hiring criteria).

2. During new-faculty orientation, alert faculty to professional advancement opportunities that involve partnerships with Student Affairs.

3. Include workshops on partnering with Student Affairs as a component of faculty development programming.
   Examples:
   * Student Development professionals make professional presentations to faculty on their “turf.” For instance, devote some faculty development programming or a piece of new-faculty orientation to provide faculty with information on student development theory and its compatibility with learning theory.
   * Student Life professionals create a newsletter for faculty that includes information on student development research, theory and practice.

4. Weigh faculty collaboration with Student Affairs seriously in the faculty retention-and-promotion process (e.g., as a heavily weighted form of faculty “service”).
5. Provide prestigious *awards* to faculty for contributions to student life (e.g., a “student service award” presented to a faculty member at graduation, convocation, or on “awards night”).

6. Create *incentives* for faculty participation in campus initiatives that involve collaboration between Academic and Student affairs (e.g., mini-grants, travel funds, campus space).

(Note: For more detailed information about promoting faculty involvement in student success initiatives, see the article titled, *Got Faculty? Promoting Faculty Involvement in First-Year Programming & Student-Success Initiatives*, in the Summit Information Packet.)
Specific Learning Outcomes Associated with Each Element of Holistic (Whole-Person) Development

**Intellectual Development**
- Becoming aware of your intellectual abilities, interests, and learning styles
- Maintaining attention and concentration
- Improving your ability to retain knowledge (long-term memory)
- Moving beyond memorization to higher levels of thinking
- Acquiring effective research skills for accessing information from a variety of sources and systems
- Viewing issues from multiple angles or viewpoints (psychological, social, political, economic, etc.) in order to attain a balanced, comprehensive perspective
- Critically evaluating ideas in terms of their truth and value
- Thinking creatively or imaginatively
- Responding constructively to differing viewpoints or opposing arguments
- Detecting and rejecting persuasion tactics that appeal to emotions rather than reason

**Personal Development**
- Developing a strong sense of personal identity and a coherent self-concept (Who am I?)
- Finding a sense of purpose direction in life (Who will I become?)
- Developing self-respect and self-esteem
- Increasing self-confidence
- Developing self-efficacy—the belief that events and outcomes in one’s life are influenced or controlled by personal initiative and effort
- Setting realistic personal goals and priorities
- Becoming self-motivated and self-disciplined
- Developing the perseverance and persistence to reach long-range goals
- Acquiring practical skills for managing personal affairs effectively and efficiently
- Becoming independent and self-reliant

**Emotional Development**
- Dealing with personal emotions in an honest, non-defensive manner
- Maintaining a healthy balance between emotional control and emotional expression
- Responding with empathy and sensitivity to emotions experienced by others
- Dealing effectively with depression
- Dealing effectively with anger
- Using effective stress-management strategies to control anxiety and tension
- Responding effectively to frustrations and setbacks
- Dealing effectively with fear of failure and poor performance
- Accepting feedback in a constructive, non-defensive manner
- Maintaining optimism and enthusiasm
**Social Development**
- Developing effective conversational skills
- Becoming an effective listener
- Relating effectively to others in one-to-one, small-group, and large-group situations
- Collaborating effectively with others when working in groups or teams
- Overcoming shyness
- Overcoming interpersonal communication apprehension and fear of public speaking
- Developing more meaningful and intimate relationships
- Resolving interpersonal conflicts assertively, rather than in aggressively or passively.
- Providing feedback to others in a constructive and considerate manner
- Relating effectively with others from different cultural backgrounds and lifestyles
- Developing leadership skills

**Physical Development**
- Maintaining awareness of your physical condition and state of health
- Applying knowledge about exercise and fitness training to promote physical and mental health
- Understanding how sleep patterns affect health and performance
- Maintaining a healthy balance between work, recreation and relaxation
- Applying knowledge of nutrition to reduce the risk of illness and promote optimal performance
- Becoming knowledgeable about nutritional imbalances and eating disorders
- Developing a positive physical self-image
- Becoming knowledgeable about the effects of drugs and their impact on physical and mental well-being
- Being knowledgeable about human sexuality and sexually transmitted diseases
- Understanding how biological differences between the sexes affect male-female relationships

**Ethical Development**
- Gaining deeper self-awareness of personal values and ethical assumptions
- Making personal choices and life decisions based on a meaningful value system
- Developing the capacity to think and act with personal integrity and authenticity
- Using electronic technology in an ethical and civil manner
- Resisting social pressure to act in ways that are inconsistent with one’s personal values
- Treating others in an ethical manner
- Knowing how to exercise individual freedom without infringing on the rights of others
- Developing a concern and commitment for human rights and social justice
- Developing the courage to confront those who violate the rights of others
- Engaging in responsible citizenship

**Spiritual Development**
- Developing a personal philosophy or world view about the meaning and purpose of human existence.
- Appreciating what cannot be completely understood
- Appreciating the mysteries associated with the origin of the universe
- Searching for the connection between the self and the larger world or cosmos
- Searching for the mystical or supernatural—that which transcends the boundaries of the natural world
- Being open to examining questions relating to death and life after death
- Being open to examining questions about the possible existence of a Supreme Being or higher power
- Being knowledgeable about different approaches to spirituality and their underlying beliefs or assumptions
- Understanding the difference and relationship between faith and reason
- Becoming aware and tolerant of religious beliefs and practices

Vocational Development
- Understanding the relationship between college majors and careers
- Employing effective strategies for exploring and identifying potential careers
- Selecting career options that are consistent with your personal values, interests, and talents
- Acquiring work experience in career fields that relate to your occupational interests
- Developing an effective résumé and portfolio
- Adopting effective strategies for identifying individuals to serve as personal references and for improving the quality of personal letters of recommendation
- Acquiring effective job-search strategies
- Using effective strategies for writing letters of inquiry and application to potential employers
- Developing strategies for performing well in personal interviews
- Acquiring effective networking skills for developing personal contacts with potential employers

≈
The Educational Role of Support Staff in Higher Education

Support staff at institutions of higher learning have the potential to be much more than customer service agents; they can also be experiential educator and student success agents. This expanded view of staff embraces the traditional emphasis on customer service, but is more inclusive and embraces the idea that students are more than customers; they are also clients and, ultimately, our "products" after graduating and assuming occupational and leadership positions. The work performed by support staff in a "learning organization" has loftier goals than the corporate world; it goes beyond merely satisfying customers and maximizing profit to enriching the lives of students and contributing to their future success.

In addition, because of their direct, first-hand contact with students on a regular basis, staff members also have the potential to functions as assessment agents by gathering data on student experiences that may be used to promote institutional effectiveness and continual quality improvement. For example, they can assess whether students are receiving clear and fair communication about campus policies and procedures, and are encountering the least amount of organizational red tape and insensitive institutional bureaucracy.

Staff working on college campuses can play a major role as educators who contribute to students’ learning, development, and persistence to graduation in the following ways:

a) by the behavior they model,
b) by their sensitive and reasoned explanations and interpretations of college policies for students,
c) by how they handle student conflicts with college personnel,
d) by their responsiveness to and referral of students in crises, and
e) by their instruction and mentoring of student employees (e.g., work-study students).

The educational potential of staff can be maximized if campuses taking a more inclusive approach to promoting student success by being more intentional about:

* including staff in professional development opportunities,
* involving staff on key campus committees, and
* encouraging staff to be research and retention agents by seeking out and systematically documenting students’ campus perceptions and experiences, documenting “critical incidents,” and contributing ideas for streamlining or minimizing institutional bureaucracy.

Unfortunately, staff influence of staff on promoting students retention, learning, and development has been underestimated, underutilized, and underappreciated on most college and university campuses. Robert Parker, Director of Human Resource at Stanford University, reports that “the best organizations see employees as contributing directly to the purposes of the organization and its success, [however] staff often feel like second-class citizens who are shown little appreciation and who aren’t sure in what way their jobs make a difference to the school.”

In a doctoral dissertation designed to identify key factors that impact the successful performance of students and staff, Vieira (1996) reported results indicating that positive student interaction with staff has a positive effect on students’ institutional satisfaction and persistence. Conversely, poor student-staff relationships were associated with student dissatisfaction and disconnection with the campus. Furthermore, it was discovered that staff members benefit from positive relationships with students, as evidenced by increased staff satisfaction with their work, increased satisfaction with their interactions with students, and a stronger feeling that their work had educational value. Lastly, certain factors were found to be consistently contributed to positive student-staff interaction and the provision of quality student service, namely: staff training, empowerment, teamwork, reward, and association with other service providers. Conversely, lack of empowerment, hierarchy, territoriality, and dissociation from other service providers were found to detract from the provision of quality service to students.
Critical Thinking. Evaluating (judging the quality of) arguments, conclusions, and ideas

Sample Question Prompts for Evaluating Validity (Truthfulness):
* Is ____ true or accurate?
* Is there sufficient evidence to support the conclusion that ____?
* Is the reasoning behind ____ strong or weak?

Sample Question for Evaluating Morality (Ethicality):
* Is ____ fair?
* Is ____ just?
* Is this action consistent with the professed or stated values of ____?

Sample Question Prompts for Evaluating Beauty (Aesthetics):
* What is the artistic merit of ____?
* Does ____ have any aesthetic value?
* Does ____ contribute to the beauty of____?

Sample Question Prompts for Evaluating Practicality (Usefulness):
* Will ____ work?
* How can ____ be put to good use?
* What practical benefit would result from ____?

Sample Question Prompts for Evaluating Priority (Order of Importance or Effectiveness):
* Which one of these ____ is the most important?
* Is this ____ the best option or choice available?
* How should these ____ be ranked from first to last (best to worst) in terms of their effectiveness?

Creative Thinking. Generating ideas that are unique, original, or distinctively different

Sample Question Prompts:
* What could be invented to ____?
* Imagine what would happen if ____?
* What would be a different way to approach ____?
* How might ____ be changed to work more effectively?
* What would be an innovative way to ____?
* What could be a new alternative that capitalizes on the advantages of ____ while minimizing its disadvantages?

Analysis (Analytical Thinking). Breaking down ideas and identifying their key components, underlying elements, or missing parts.

Sample Questions Prompts:
* What are the main ideas contained in ____?
* What are the most important, significant, or relevant aspects of ____?
* What are the key issues raised by ____?
* What assumptions or biases lie hidden within ____?
* What are the reasons behind ____?
* What are the underlying causes of ____?
* How are the ideas contained in ____ similar to or different than ____?
* What additional information or resources are needed to ____?

Synthesis. Building up ideas by piecing them together into a larger whole, organizational framework, or integrated system.

Sample Question Prompts:
* How can this idea be joined or connected with ____ to create a more complete or comprehensive understanding of ____?
* How could these different ____ be grouped together into a more general class or category?
* How could these separate ____ be reorganized or rearranged to produce a more comprehensive understanding of the big picture?

**Application (Applied Thinking).** Putting knowledge into practice to solve problems and resolve issues.

* Sample Question Prompts:
  * What can be done with this idea to ____?
  * How can this idea be used to solve ____?
  * How could this concept implemented for the purpose of ____?
  * How can this theory be put into practice to ____?
  * What could be done with this idea to improve ____?

**Multidimensional Thinking.** Thinking that involves viewing yourself and the world around you from different angles or vantage points.

* Sample Question Prompts:
  * How would ____ affect different dimensions of myself (emotional, physical, etc.)?
  * What broader impact would ____ have on the social and physical world around me?
  * How might people living in different times (e.g., past and future) view ____?
  * How would people from different cultural backgrounds interpret or react to ____?
  * Have I taken into consideration all the major factors that could influence ____ or be influenced by ____?

**Inferential Reasoning.** Making an argument or judgment by inferring (stepping to) a conclusion that’s supported by empirical (observable) evidence or logical consistency

* Sample Question Prompts for Empirical Evidence:
  * What examples support the argument that ____?
  * What research evidence is there for ____?
  * What statistical data document that this ____ is true?

* Sample Question Prompts for Logical Consistency:
  * Since ____ is true, why shouldn’t ____ also be true?
  * If people believe in ____, shouldn’t they practice ____?
  * To make the statement that ____ , wouldn’t it have to be assumed that ____?

**Balanced Thinking.** Carefully considering arguments and evidence for/against opposing points of view, noting their relative strengths and weaknesses

* Sample Question Prompts for Balanced Thinking:
  * What are the strengths (advantages) and weaknesses (disadvantages) of ____?
  * What evidence supports and contradicts ____?
  * What are arguments for and counterarguments against ____?
  * What are the risks and benefits of ____?

* Trigger Question Prompts for Adduction (arguing for a particular idea or position by supplying supporting evidence):
  * What proof is there for ____?
  * What are logical arguments for ____?
  * What research evidence supports ____?
  * What are the merits of ____?
  * What are possible objections to ____ and how could they be countered?

* Trigger Question Prompts for Refutation (arguing against a particular idea or position by supplying contradictory evidence):
  * What proof is there against ____?
  * What logical arguments indicate that ____ is false?
  * What research evidence contradicts ____?
  * What are the limitations of ____?
  * What contradictions or inconsistencies are there in this ____?
References


