

# 2016-21 Strategic Agenda

## **Guiding Documentation**

Based on policy forum feedback

Unit/Department: Executive

<u>CPE Contact</u> Melissa Young Email: <u>melissa.young@ky.gov</u>

College Access (3/20/15)	1
Diversity (3/24/15)	6
Regional & Community Development (3/25/15)	11
Financial Barrier to College (4/8/15)	15
Academic Readiness (4/9/15)	19
Research & Innovation (4/27/15)	25
Student Success (4/29/15)	31
Postsecondary Education & the Workforce (5/4/15)	36

## **COLLEGE ACCESS POLICY FORUM**

#### Introduction

The College Access Forum was held on March 20, 2015, at the Kentucky Council on Postsecondary Education to gather feedback from key stakeholders to inform the 2016-2020 Strategic Agenda for Postsecondary and Adult Education. Twenty-six individuals with expertise in college access issues attended, including representatives from the Kentucky Department of Education, GEAR UP KY, the Prichard Committee, TRIO/Upward Bound, KHEAA, Kentucky Campus Compact, Kentucky Educational Television, and university registrar and admissions offices.

#### **Major Themes**

The need for more student support, especially for at-risk populations. Participants voiced their concerns about the lack of sufficient academic, social, and financial support for students most at-risk of not completing college, both in K-12 and college settings. Specifically, there are not enough resources for returning adult students, military veterans, undocumented students, individuals with criminal backgrounds, young adults in foster care, and students without parental support, as well as low-income, underprepared, and underrepresented minority students. Much of this discussion focused on the shortcomings of K-12 guidance counselors, as administrative and assessment duties have overwhelmed their traditional college and career advising roles.

The need to begin college awareness activities much earlier in the educational process. Programs like GEAR UP Kentucky begin as early as eighth grade, but most participants felt college-going messages and activities need to begin even earlier in elementary school and during early childhood education. Families need to understand the value of postsecondary education and its return on investment in terms of income, job mobility, quality of life, and other health and wellness outcomes. Having employers reinforce these messages at their workplaces may strengthen their effectiveness.

#### The need for more flexible postsecondary delivery

formats. While technology has enabled service providers to be more nimble, adaptable, and accessible, too many colleges and universities continue to deliver a one-size-fits-all model. For students trying to juggle work and family, there is a need for more convenient, flexible, and affordable postsecondary delivery options. Online proprietary schools capture a large segment of the non-traditional student population due to flexible scheduling and aggressive marketing campaigns; unfortunately, these schools often fail to graduate students, leaving them with high levels of student debt. Similarly, there is a need to raise awareness about multiple pathways to degree completion, including stackable credentials, 2-year to 4-year "completer" degrees, reverse transfer, career ladders, and other less-publicized routes to a postsecondary credential that may be a better fit for students interested in vocational and technical occupations.

The lack of "grit" and other non-cognitive factors that lead to college success. There was overwhelming consensus that too many students are failing to develop key attitudes and behaviors linked to student success. These include perseverance, motivation, independence, study skills, organizational skills, discipline, and what's colloquially referred to as "grit." Financial literacy is an important non-cognitive factor; too many students and families lack a basic understanding of how to finance college, including college savings strategies and techniques.



#### What's Working

Participants were asked to identify current statewide strategies that are having a positive impact on students' ability to access a college education. Responses included:

- Legislative mandates in Senate Bill 1 (2009) that require students who are not meeting college readiness standards to receive academic interventions.
- EPAS assessments in high school and other mandated assessments of college/career readiness.
- Transparent, shared college readiness standards among K-12 and postsecondary education.
- The Kentucky College Coaches Program and similar programs that place near-peer mentors in high schools.
- GEAR UP Kentucky, which provides college awareness activities and supports from grades 8-12 to low-income Kentucky schools.
- The KEES scholarship, which has high visibility among Kentucky students and families, has motivated many lower and middle-class students to pursue in-state postsecondary opportunities.
- KHEAA's College Bowl Sunday and other outreach efforts have increased the number of FAFSA applications and general awareness of state and federal financial aid resources.
- The Kentucky Latino Education Alliance has been successful in raising academic aspirations and expectations of Hispanic students.
- Corporate educational assistance and incentives (e.g., UPS, Norton Healthcare) that increase college access for working adults, a key segment of the state's target population.

#### What's Not Working

Participants brainstormed about current statewide strategies that have not been as effective in increasing student access. Responses included:

- Statewide communication and marketing campaigns are not coordinated, well-funded, or sustained enough to significantly impact college enrollment.
- Efforts to close achievement gaps in college access and readiness are not significantly moving the needle.
- College awareness and readiness activities often live inside the school building, but they do not significantly affect parental engagement and support.
- The state's need-based financial aid programs (CAP, KTG) are underfunded, and there is little to no financial support for adult students.
- KCTCS's open admissions policy does some students a disservice. Institutions should not admit students who have a very low probability of success.
- We are losing too many students who enroll in college but never show up for the first semester. This phenomenon is called "summer melt."
- Many of our most successful strategies, like Kentucky College Coaches and GEAR UP, are not available at every school.
- Financial aid vocabulary is difficult for many families to understand. Additionally, there is little standardization in language among federal, state, and institutional aid programs. The FAFSA is difficult to understand and complete.
- While KEES is a highly visible program, students need a better understanding of the college requirements they must meet to keep their scholarships. Perhaps the college GPA requirement should be eliminated.
- Students need better advice to determine how much student debt to incur based on their major or projected future earnings.

#### **Recommended Strategies**

- Intentionally integrate financial literacy training into the high school and college curriculum, and consider adding some financial literacy activities for parents of elementary and middle school students. Kentucky could add a component to the high school Individual Learning Plan (ILP) that addresses financial literacy.
- Increase college awareness activities in K-12 schools, which may include events like alma mater day, where teachers wear college sweatshirts and invite career professionals and recent graduates to talk about their college experiences. Ensure these opportunities are available to all students, not just students identified as high achieving.
- Coordinate a statewide college awareness campaign that builds a college-going culture in every area of the state and communicates the value of a postsecondary degree.
- Design specific outreach materials and strategies for every grade level (consider using social media and digital apps) to facilitate college planning and savings.
- Simplify college outreach and financial aid materials so they are easier to understand, and translate materials into Spanish.
- Evaluate current outreach and access strategies to determine their effectiveness, and promote research-based practices with proven results.
- Restructure the role of K-12 guidance counselors and provide more professional training and support, including use of supplemental resources like college coaches or near-peer mentors.
- Provide more immediate engagement for incoming freshmen during the summer (e.g., pre-orientation activities, social events, summer coaching sessions with near peers, social media reminders and contacts).

- Develop an intentional, systematic checklist or "roadmap" to college. This could be a digital app that provides reminders and prompts about different college readiness activities, deadlines, and requirements.
- Provide more intentional career exploration and development activities in K-12 and postsecondary education, and increase students' understanding of the kind of education and training needed for different careers. Increase employers' visibility and involvement in schools.
- Support federal efforts to simplify FAFSA completion by using prior-year tax data. This tax data would automatically populate an electronic form so parents or students would not have to enter it themselves.

#### **Feedback on Metrics**

- It would be interesting to capture how many Pell grant funds are left on the table by Kentucky students each year. A federal source estimates this figure at \$40 million.
- Could we begin to capture students who go to out-of-state colleges in our college-going metric? It also would be good if our completion rate tracked students who transferred to outof-state institutions and earned a degree elsewhere.
- Participants would like the Council to track the retention and graduation rates of developmental education students over time.
- A tool like ACT Engage, a behavioral skills assessment, could be used to measure noncognitive student success skills and identify gaps for future interventions.
- It would be interesting to conduct a survey to determine why some college-ready high school graduates do not enroll in college, as well as the reasons for "summer melt."

The Council on Postsecondary Education thanks the Lumina Foundation Strategy Labs for its financial support of these Strategic Agenda Policy Forums.

#### **Appendix A: Participants**

Derek Ball, Financial Aid Program Director, Kentucky Community and Technical College System

Kim Barber, CPE Committee on Equal Opportunities & Steering Committee member

**Cindy Baumertt**, Director, Governor's Commonwealth Institute for Parent Leadership, Prichard Committee on Academic Excellence

Emma Brown, Director, Community Engagement, Louisville's 55,000 Degrees

Nancy Carpenter, Senior Director, Education, Kentucky Eduational Television

Kim Chaffer-Schroeder, Office of Admissions, Transylvania University

**Dan Connell**, Kentucky Association of Educational Opportunity Program Personnel (TRiO Ky) & Assistant Vice President of Adult Education and College Access, Morehead State University

Connie Cox, University of Louisville

Lori Davis, General Counsel, Kentucky State University

Kim Dolan, Kentucky Higher Education Assistance Authority

**Mason Dyer**, Vice President for External Relations and Information, Association of Independent Kentucky Colleges and Universities

Melissa Goins, Director, Family Resource and Youth Service Centers

LaCrystal Green, Kentucky Association of College Registrars & Admissions Officers

John Greenwell, Student Services Jefferson County Adult Education Center

Gayle Hilleke, Kentucky Campus Compact, Americorp Program

Randolph Hollingsworth, Assistant Provost, Undergraduate Education, University of Kentucky

Dennis Horn, RTT Project Manager, OVEC

Terry Hosler, Berea College

Sharon Hunter, Director, Strategic Enrollment Management, Western Kentucky University

**Shauna King-Simms**, System Director Of College and Career Transitions, Kentucky Community and Technical College System

Beth Lawson, Regional Program Manager, GEAR UP Kentucky

Wendy Nealy, GUK Parent Engagement, GEAR UP Kentucky

**April Pieper**, Branch Manager, Differentiated Learning Branch, Office of Next Generation Learning, Kentucky Department of Education

Jenny Sawyer, Executive Director of Admissions, University of Louisville

Leslie Slaughter, Policy Advisor, Career & Technical Education, Kentucky Depatment of Education

## **DIVERSITY POLICY FORUM**

#### Introduction

The Diversity Forum was held on March 24, 2015, at the Council on Postsecondary Education to gather feedback from key stakeholders to inform the 2016-2020 Strategic Agenda for Postsecondary and Adult Education. Thirty-five individuals with expertise in diversity issues attended, including members of the CPE Committee on Equal Opportunities, the Kentucky Latino Education Alliance, university EEO representatives, local representatives of the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People, minority college students, and others.

### **Major Themes**

# A commitment to diversity needs to be front and center in the Council's next strategic agenda.

Participants overwhelmingly felt that the current Strategic Agenda does not signal strongly enough the Council's commitment to diversity. The word diversity does not appear in the mission or vision statement. Some participants felt that "diversity" should become a focus area in the next plan (like "college readiness" or "student success"), while others thought diversity objectives and strategies should be interwoven throughout all of the focus areas. Participants noted that if diversity objectives and strategies are not explicitly stated in the plan or given a high enough profile, too often they become an afterthought for institutional presidents and administrators. The current objectives and metrics in institutional diversity plans are not robust enough and require only a miminal effort on the part of institutions to comply.

### All educational institutions and providers in Kentucky need to become more culturally

**competent.** The National Center for Cultural Competence offers several definitions of "cultural competence," but perhaps the most widely accepted is

"a set of congruent behaviors, attitudes, and policies that come together in a system, agency or among professionals that enables [them] to work effectively in cross-cultural situations." In educational settings, the National Education Association defines it as "developing certain personal and interpersonal awareness and sensitivities, understanding certain bodies of cultural knowledge, and mastering a set of skills that, taken together, underlie effective cross-cultural teaching and culturally responsive teaching." Participants felt that, despite progress, there is much work to do in Kentucky to build more inclusive and welcoming culturally competent schools and educators. Participants shared instances where prospective minority students have had negative experiences on campus tours, or with admissions officers, registrars, financial aid officers, or other personnel who were their first point of contact. When recruiting diverse students and faculty members, we should be able to point them to relevant community and social organizations or resources, as well as provide advice on local neighborhoods, places of worship, or where to buy specific products. To remedy the situation, cultural competence needs to be part of the core curriculum for teacher preparation programs and a central component of professional development programs for current educators, school leaders, and staff.

#### We need to find more effective strategies for closing achievement gaps. Participants found Kentucky's lack of progress in closing achievement gaps for underrepresented minority students somewhat discouraging. Despite many statewide and institutional inititatives, ACT scores and college graduation rates for these students are flat. Participants wondered if current programs are ineffective, or if there are other mitigating circumstances that are not being adequately addressed. Strengthening cultural competence may be a key strategy in closing these gaps.



#### We need to reach diverse students and families

where they are. Places of worship and neighborhood or community centers are important communication channels for many minority students and families. The growth of online outreach materials and activities (like KnowHow2Go) is positive, but online resources cannot be effective if students do not have broadband access at home. If we produce informational print materials for prospective college students, we must publish them in languages other than English, and we must ensure they are written in such a way as to be easily understood by people outside of education.

#### What's Working

Participants were asked to identify current statewide strategies that are having a positive impact on diversity. Responses included:

- The SREB Doctoral Scholars program has increased the number of diverse faculty members in Kentucky institutions.
- The CEO adopted a more inclusive definition of diversity that encompasses issues of gender and sexual orientation.
- Outreach programs like the Governor's Minority Student College Preparation Program (GMSCPP), YMCA Black Achievers, and GEAR UP have been successful in providing early intervention for at-risk students, but programs need to begin even earlier.
- The Kentucky Latino Education Alliance is having a positive impact on the aspirations and educational outcomes of Hispanic students.
- Internships and coop programs have been successful in increasing the engagement of minority students at some institutions. This translates into better student outcomes.
- Pairing minority students with minority mentors and advisers is an effective strategy. Some institutions have successfully trained alumni or community members to mentor students.
- The summer bridge programs at Kentucky State University and Morehead have helped many

minority students address their college readiness needs before they matriculate.

 Free high school dual credit programs are particularly valuable for undocumented students who want to go to college but are not eligible for many sources of financial aid.

#### What's Not Working

Participants brainstormed about current statewide strategies that have not been as effective in increasing diversity. Responses included:

- K-12 and postsecondary education need more inclusive curricula that reflect the history and experiences of racial-ethnic minority groups. Educators should use pedagogical practices that reflect, value, and elicit diversity.
- There is lingering tension between the need to broaden notions of diversity and the fear that doing so will weaken our commitment to African-American and Hispanic students.
- The statewide diversity policy and institutional plans have not translated into improved performance on key objectives (e.g, student diversity, faculty and staff diversity, minority student outcomes).
- While student organizations to support diversity on campus are important (e.g., LGBTQ organizations), their existence does not necessarily indicate an institutional commitment to diversity, which is necessary to shift the culture and promote lasting, systemic change.
- Too often diversity initiatives are assigned to a single office or committee within the university and do not receive wide institutional support or attention. One participant stated, "Diversity committees on campus have no power. They don't have much impact because diversity is not woven into the fabric of the institution."
- The lack of diversity of KEES recipients suggests that the state's financial aid programs may need to be revised. Consider adding a need-based

component to KEES or equalizing funding between KEES and CAP/KTG.

- Although Kentucky's college readiness standards are good, care must be taken in admissions decisions to balance academic performance with the need to enroll a more diverse student population. Not all students of color should be funneled to KCTCS because of statewide college readiness standards.
- There is not enough minority parental support and involvement. How can we do a better job of educating and engaging parents sooner in the process?
- Very few of the state's college outreach materials are translated into languages other than English.
- Some counselors are not encouraging undocumented students to apply for financial aid, even though there are some institutional aid programs for which they are eligible. It is up to counselors to educate themselves about available resources and help these students navigate the process.

### **Recommended Strategies**

- Implement programs to recruit more diverse students into education professions, as teachers, administrators, counselors/advisors, and faculty members. Find ways to increase minority participation on school Site-Based Decision Making Councils.
- Increase cultural competence in K-12 schools and college campuses for all school staff and personnnel so that all students are welcomed, valued, supported, and accommodated.
- Help teachers accommodate different learning styles and more effectively respond to the needs of diverse students.
- Develop a financial incentive model within the CPE budget to reward the hiring of minority faculty and staff.

- Increase alignment between the CPE's statewide diversity policy, institutional diversity plans, and the Strategic Agenda for Postsecondary and Adult Education.
- Increase the number and quality of academic interventions for minority students and begin them sooner than middle school. Increase mentoring, advising, and tutoring programs, and pair minority students with minority mentors whenever possible.
- Provide more counseling to at-risk students and help them develop the non-cognitive behaviors and attitudes that will lead to success.
- Implement more parental engagement strategies for underreperesented minority families.

### **Feedback on Metrics**

- CPE needs to be clear about what racial-ethnic minority categories are included in the metrics (i.e., are Asian populations included? Native Americans?)
- Is there an appropriate metric that could be used to monitor cultural competency on campus? Consider a metric that looks at dollars or resources devoted to this.
- CPE needs to break out peformance on the metrics by race/ethnicity whenever feasible to focus more attention on achievement gaps.
- Participants would like to see diversity metrics incorporated into a postsecondary performance funding model.

The Council on Postsecondary Education thanks the Lumina Foundation Strategy Labs for its financial support of these Strategic Agenda Policy Forums.

#### **Appendix A: Participants**

**Terry Allen,** EEO Representative, University of Kentucky J.H. Atkins, Assistant Vice President, Centre College Genny Ballard, Kentucky Latino Education Alliance Kim Barber, CPE Committee on Equal Opportunities and Strategic Agenda Steering Committee member JoAnne Bland, CPE Committee on Equal Opportunities Jerome Bowles, CPE Committee on Equal Opportunities Brian Buford, Assistant Provost for Diversity, University of Louisville Maria Bush, Delta Sigma Theta Juan Castro, JCC Group Roger Cleveland, Eastern Kentucky University Ricardo Nazario Colon, Kentucky Latino Education Alliance Raoul Cunningham, State NAACP Alexis Fonville, Student, Kentucky State University Andrea Garr-Barnes, Director of Institutional Diversity and Inclusion, Western Kentucky University Natalie Gibson, EEO Representative, Kentucky Community and Technical College System Charles Holloway, EEO Representative, Morehead State University Erin Howard, Latino Outreach Director, Bluegrass Community and Technical College Dennis Jackson, Chair, CPE Committee on Equal Opportunities John Johnson, CPE Committee on Equal Opportunities Edgardo Mansilla, Kentucky Latino Education Alliance Steve Mason, Chief of Staff, Kentucky State University Linda McCray, Former Executive Director, Bowling Green Human Rights Commission Shannon Means, Director of Policy and Data Analysis, University of Kentucky **Gladys Miller**, Director, Career and Coop Education, Eastern Kentucky University

Richard Miller, EEO Representative, Western Kentucky University Shambra Mulder, NAACP Education Chair for State Conference Charles Neblett, Community Projects, Inc., Russellville, Ky Marvinia Neblett, Community Projects, Inc., Russellville, Ky Samuel Oleka, Dean, Kentucky State University Kathleen Roberts, EEO Representative, Northern Kentucky University Robert Staat, Professor of Microbiology, University and CPE and CEO member Arnold Taylor, CEO & CPE Strategic Agenda Steering Committee member Isabel Taylor, Kentucky Latino Eduation Alliance Mordean Taylor, EEO Representative, University of Louisville Sherwood Thompson,EEO Representative, Eastern Kentucky University Catherine Wallace, NAACP Education Chair for State Conference

#### Introduction

The Regional and Community Development Policy Forum was held on March 25, 2015, at the Kentucky Council on Postsecondary Education to gather feedback from key stakeholders to inform the 2016-2020 Strategic Agenda for Postsecondary and Adult Education. Twenty-one individuals with expertise in regional and community development attended, including representatives from Workforce Investment Boards, campus offices of community engagement and regional stewardship, regional campus directors, Chambers of Commerce, and others.

#### **Major Themes**

The need to better align the strengths and resources of campuses with the challenges facing local regions/communities. There was conversation throughout the day about the need for more intentional communication between campuses and community and regional leaders in identifying issues and aligning appropriate resources and programs. Academic programs should be developed in partnership with regional employers to respond to current and anticipated workforce needs, and faculty tenure processes should recognize and reward this work. The group also stressed the importance of campuses helping communities understand the root causes of poverty and unemployment and determining how resources can be used to improve quality of life in a meaningful, sustainable way.

### The need for better evaluation of existing programs to determine their effectiveness in meeting regional and community needs. While

there is a lot of campus activity in regions to strengthen economies and improve social and educational services, there is little comprehensive evaluation of program effectiveness. The regional stewardship program has been in place since the mid-2000s, but there has been only minimal state-level evaluation of how the program has affected university service regions. More needs to be done to evaluate programs and strategies that advance local economies. Effective strategies should be replicated and scaled up to improve statewide outcomes. Ideally, some funding would be tied to the success of university outreach activities.

TRONGER

The value of campus and community leadership in helping drive conversation and activity in support of regional and community development. Effective leadership can be the difference between a successful or unsuccessful regional stewardship initiative. Finding the right individual with the vision and skills to drive improvement is crucial—whether that is a faculty member, a county judge executive, or a mayor. Leadership training may be needed in some regions to develop these types of skills. If a community is able to develop a shared, long-term vision for future improvement, resources and programs can be targeted toward accomplishing these collective goals.

The need for dedicated resources for regional and community development (including greater support for regional campuses) tied to program

effectiveness. The need for resources to support regional collaborations and campus work in this area is critical. There is an expectation that campuses will be catalysts in driving community and regional advancement, but there is little in the way of dedicated resources to support the time and effort it takes to build collaborations and produce a meaningful impact. Furthermore, there are hidden costs to doing this work, like legal liability protection, which are not subsidized. More resources are needed to fund program development and evaluation and to scale up programs that are proven successful. The group also discussed the need to adequately support regional campuses and community and technical college branches to help colleges penetrate large service regions.

#### The need for statewide policies and strategies that advance postsecondary education's role in regional and community development. The

group stressed the important role of the Council in facilitating conversations about the power of campus/community partnerships to advance local economies. Statewide programs like Regional Stewardship jump-started conversations and activities around postsecondary education's role in community development. State-level goals, objectives and accountability measures focused on key priorities to advance this work. When Regional Stewardship appropriations were rolled into the base budgets of universities, the Council no longer required annual Regional Stewardship reports and pulled back on its advisory role. As a result, the statewide Regional Stewardship initiative has lost focus, visibility, and momentum.

## What's Working

Participants were asked to identify current statewide strategies that are having a positive impact on regional and community development. Responses included:

- The Work-Ready Communities initiative has rallied communities around improvement strategies, particularly in regard to increased educational attainment. However, there need to be more discernible incentives for communities who achieve work-ready status.
- The state has initiated several projects that show promise of reaching more non-traditional adult students, like Learn on Demand, Commonwealth College, and Project Graduate.
- The University Center of the Mountains is a good example of successful collaboration between KCTCS, public and independent postsecondary institutions.
- Dual credit/enrollment has helped encourage more high school students to pursue postsecondary programs, but these programs need more uniformity and availability across the state.

 Programs like Louisville's 55,000 Degrees have raised awareness of the importance of educational attainment and have rallied communities around a common attainment goal.

### What's Not Working

Participants brainstormed about current statewide strategies that have not been as effective in improving regional and community development. Responses included:

- There needs to be better coordination among all university outreach efforts and better alignment of statewide, university, and community plans.
- Too often, regional and community development/outreach is a one-way street; institutions initiate programs and services but communities never approach or consult institutions about their needs. This work is often transactional instead of transformational.
- Often, the right university expert is not "at the table" in regional conversations. Universities should ensure that seats on regional councils and boards are assigned based on expertise and not position.
- Currently, the development of new academic programs is driven more by faculty strengths and interests than by workforce or community needs.
- There are not enough incentives for public and independent postsecondary institutions operating within the same region to cooperate instead of compete.
- Some university service regions are too large for institutions to make a meaningful contribution or impact in every part of the region.
- There is no outcome-based performance funding model to incentivize colleges to place more emphasis on educational attainment and outreach.
- Current faculty promotion and tenure systems do not adequately reward community service and engagement activities.
- Eastern Kentucky's federal Promise Zone designation is a great opportunity for the region,

but universities need to be fully utilized in these grants.

• Universities are not providing enough service and experiential learning opportunities and internships for students.

## **Recommended Strategies**

- Encourage more collaborative arrangements like The University Center of the Mountains and promote dual admission and enrollment among two-year and four-year campuses.
- Encourage postsecondary education institutions to promote health and wellness in regional outreach activities, extension services, and among their faculty, staff, and students.
- Develop a broad educational attainment goal (like Louisville's 55,000 Degrees initiative) that will drive improvement and create a common understanding of the value of postsecondary education to regional and community economies.
- Create an advocacy campaign around increasing educational attainment and enlist business and community champions to help carry the message.
- Revisit the Final Recommendations of the Rural Access Work Group to guide future objectives and strategies in the area of regional and community development.
- Align the next strategic agenda for postsecondary and adult education with the agendas of the Cabinet for Economic Development, the Cabinet for Workforce Development, and other key partners engaged in regional and community development.

## **Feedback on Metrics**

- CPE should disaggregate more data by region. This could be a powerful tool for highlighting the critical educational attainment needs of rural areas of the state.
- Ideally, there should be more metrics in the area of regional and community development, not just educational attainment. Could there be qualitative metrics that capture the kind of strategies that are occurring? Could the state measure community outreach expenditures?
- There is a lack of clarity about what the Council expects and values in the area of regional and community development. Part of this confusion stems from a lack of well-defined objectives and measures.
- There is a need to track credentials (e.g., certificates) below the associate level. These are often pathways to lucrative careers.
- The Council should develop some metrics to capture the impact universities have on statewide and regional well-being.
- Measuring employment outcomes by major actually may help communicate the value of liberal arts and general studies degrees and dispel the myth that these graduates are not employable.
- Postsecondary education could do a better job of communicating the relationship between educational attainment and health outcomes. If we raise education levels, health will improve.

#### **Appendix A: Participants**

Leah Aswill, Director, ALIVE Center for Community Partnerships

Ron Bunch, President & CEO, Bowling Green Area Chamber of Commerce

Al Cross, Director, Institute for Rural Journalism and Community Issues, University of Kentucky

**Mason Dyer,** Vice President for External Relations and Information, Association of Kentucky Independent Colleges and Universities

Terry Gray, Regional Campus Director – Manchester, Eastern Kentucky University

Dan Hall, Vice President for the Office of Community Engagement, University of Louisvlle

Jan Hillard, Associate Provost for Research, Graduate Studies and Regional Stewardship, Northern Kentucky University

Irma Johnson, Coordinator, Regional Stewardship, Kentucky State University

Alice Jones, Professor of Geography, CARES, Eastern Kentucky University

Dan Lavit, Assistant Dean, Regional Academic Outreach, Murray State University

J. Marshall, Executive Director, Center for Regional Engagement, Morehead State University

Pam Miller, CPE Council Member and former Mayor of Lexington

Bill Pierce, Vice President of Research and Innovation, University of Louisville

Brian Roy, Deputy Director, Kentucky Association of Counties

Kristel Smith, Director, Kentucky Innovation Network, Richmond

Diana Taylor, Taylor-Gray Associates, KY Chamber of Commerce

Brad Thomas, East Kentucky Cooperative

Gina Winchester, Executive Director of Regional Outreach, Murray State University

Joe Wind, Vice President for Government and Community Relations and Advisor to the President, Northern Kentucky University

Sara Zeigler, Dean, University Programs, Eastern Kentucky University

Sherrill Zimmerman, CPE Board Member and Strategic Agenda Steering Committee Chair

## **FINANCIAL BARRIERS POLICY FORUM**



#### Introduction

The Financial Barriers Forum was held on April 7, 2015, at the Kentucky Council on Postsecondary Education to gather feedback from key stakeholders to inform the 2016-2020 Strategic Agenda for Postsecondary and Adult Education. Twenty-five individuals with expertise in college affordability issues attended, including representatives from GEAR UP KY, the Legislative Research Commission, 55K Degrees, KHEAA, the Governor's budget office, student government, and university student financial aid and enrollment offices.

#### **Major Themes**

#### The need for earlier and better advising about college financing, greater transparency about college costs, and simplification of financial aid

**processes.** This was a common refrain throughout the day and was heard from virtually all participants. Students often are unaware of the necessary steps to apply for financial aid and are not starting the process early enough. Many families are intimidated by the process and will give up before all the steps are taken. College costs are not well understood, and often there is inadequate knowledge about student loans. Despite efforts to make college costs more transparent through tools like college cost calculators, many students still struggle to understand college financing. Several people suggested that high school counselors need better training in this area.

The need for greater state investment in needbased financial aid. This was another issue that surfaced repeatedly throughout the day. Thousands of eligible students don't receive state need-based financial aid due to lack of funding. This is a particular concern for adult and part-time students, many of whom apply later in the year for financial aid. Several people mentioned that the state is not directing the statutorily required amount of lottery funding into state aid programs. Some also mentioned that students are running out of state aid before graduating due to the costs and time associated with non-credit bearing developmental education courses. Students who take longer to graduate often run out of federal financial aid eligibility as well.

The need for an organized, comprehensive campaign about the value of postsecondary education and strategies for college-going. As in several other policy forums, a number of participants suggested that there is need for a statewide campaign to promote the value of college. The campaign should include messaging about specific strategies and processes for college admissions and financial aid applications. The Education Pays campaign from the early 2000s, as well as Go Higher and Know How to Go were mentioned as examples.

#### The need for a review of state mandated tuition

waivers. The concern over mandated tuition waivers was a common refrain. These waivers, which are in statute, require public campuses to waive tuition for specific populations without regard to financial need, such as public postsecondary faculty members, foster children, and spouses and dependents of service members killed or injured in the line of duty. Participants expressed concern about the increase in waivers and the impact they have on campuses' ability to serve other needy students. It was suggested that all of these waivers be reviewed to determine if they are still relevant and necessary.

#### The need for more research and information about college-ready students who decide not to attend college, or who register but never show

**up.** A number of participants suggested that we don't know enough about summer melt—students who register for courses but never show up, as well as the reasons academically capable students choose to forego college. Data resources like the National Student Clearinghouse could help us analyze income profiles

and other student information so we can develop more targeted strategies to address these issues.

### What's Working

Participants were asked to identify current statewide strategies that are having a positive impact on students' ability to overcome financial barriers to a college education. Responses included:

- CAP is need-based and caters to all kinds of students.
- KTG provides opportunities for needy students to attend private, independent colleges.
- Spalding University has a five and a half week, two-course semester that caters to adults. (alternative scheduling). The financial aid office has made this work for adults.
- The KEES program is helping traditional-age students attend college.
- The FAFSA is simpler now than it was in the past, but there is room for improvement.
- Tax credits work well for middle income students (the ones right above the Pell cutoff). Perhaps the ceiling for the tax credit should be lowered so more families could qualify.
- The University of Kentucky medical school has a fixed cost model—this model is easy to explain to students and parents.
- Four-year guarantees are working for some campuses—students are guaranteed a fixed annual cost if they finish in four years.
- Outreach workshops held by campuses, KHEAA and others are very helpful for many students.

#### What's Not Working

Participants brainstormed about current statewide strategies that have not been as effective in improving financial access to college. Responses included:

- Funding for need-based aid is insufficient. Money runs out in February and thousands of eligible students are left out.
- The KTG funding formula hasn't changed since the 1970s and needs to be modernized.

- Aid is awarded on a semester basis and is not flexible enough to address alternative delivery models or people who finish early.
- Institutions receive no funding for statemandated tuition waiver programs, which are growing every year. For example, public postsecondary faculty members and Area Technology Center instructors are granted tuition waivers to attend any institution in Kentucky. This was passed to help many instructors gain certifications required by accrediting agencies, but the time for this measure has passed.
- There is a lack of transparency about the true cost of college once room and board, books, and other expenses are considered. More and simpler information is needed for students and families to understand their bottom line. "Net" cost is not easily understood and means different things to different people and schools. More standardization is needed.
- Effective program review strategies are needed to ensure institutions are able to sunset programs that are no longer in demand (this is a way to achieve cost savings that could be passed on to students).
- Without adequate state support, enrollment and tuition revenue declines can result in the reduction of institutional student aid and support services.
- Work-study funding needs to be increased.
- The definition of an "independent student" needs to be revisited to make it easier for them to qualify for financial aid.
- College-savings programs (529) are not realistic for all income levels.
- Pell award levels are not high enough to meet students' financial needs.
- The FAFSA verification process is not working because it is tied to tax returns. It would be helpful to be able to use prior-year tax information.
- Higher education tax credits tend to help only higher income individuals.
- We allocate aid at 12 credit hours instead of 15 hours, which may create a disincentive for some students to take the necessary number of hours to graduate in four years.

- Attendance at outreach workshops tends to be low.
- The required federal net price calculators do not work and are not helpful for students. There is little consistency in these tools among schools.

### **Recommended Strategies**

- Increase funding for state need-based aid programs.
- Achieve compliance with existing statutes regarding the amount of lottery money that should go to state aid programs.
- Implement an organized, focused communication campaign to provide early college information and outreach to students and families. KHEAA and CPE might lead this effort.
- Raise awareness of the value of higher education. Institutions should work together to educate students, not compete against each other.
- Develop better financial literacy programs and information about wise borrowing.
- Improve training for guidance counselors or other near-peer mentors about college access strategies and financial aid.
- Evaluate mandated tuition waivers and associated costs and justify the continuation of each program.
- Institutions should freely discuss how they are using institutional aid with each other to increase transparency and the sharing of best practices.

- Explore the development of a free community college program like that in Tennessee. The effect on the comprehensive campuses would need to be considered, as would the cost and impact on KCTCS.
- Revise statutes and regulations to ensure parttime and adults students qualify for aid and increase grant funding for these students.
- Develop a better definition of "unmet need."
- Increase opportunities for students to get college credit while in high school to help reduce college costs.
- Support federal efforts to simplify FAFSA completion by using prior-year tax data. This tax data would automatically populate an electronic form so parents or students would not have to enter it themselves.
- Target financial aid programs and education efforts for students and families with the biggest challenges, such as undocumented students, first-generation students, students from economically depressed areas of the state, and middle class students who are just over the income threshold for Pell grant eligibility and other need-based programs.

## **Feedback on Metrics**

- CPE should look at net price for each income quartile—this is a better metric for affordability and one that CPE used in the past.
- The "eligible but did not receive aid" metric is too broad. It includes everyone who filled out a FAFSA but should only include those who applied and were accepted to a school.

The Council on Postsecondary Education thanks the Lumina Foundation Strategy Labs for its financial support of these Strategic Agenda Policy Forums.

#### **Appendix A: Participants**

Jamie Bland, Financial Aid Program Coordinator, Kentucky Community and Technical College System Ben Boggs, Legislative Research Commission Duane Bonifer, Director of Public Relations, Lindsey Wilson College Gary Cox, President, Association of Independent Kentucky Colleges and Universities Fred Dietz, Executive Director of Enrollment Management, Murray State University Bryan Erslan, Eastern Kentucky University Ted Franzeim, Kentucky Higher Education Assistance Authority Erin Klarer, VP Government Relations, Kentucky Higher Education Assistance Authority Charliese Lewis, GEAR UP KY Kathy Marshall, Office of State Budget Director Angie Martin, Chief Budget Officer, University of Kentucky and Strategic Agenda Steering Committee member Lilly Massa-McKinley, Sr. Director, Project Management, 55,000 Degrees Michelle Meek, Bluegrass Community and Technical College System Brett Morris, Director of Admissions, Eastern Kentucky University Sandy Neel, Student Financial Aid Director, University of Louisville Victoria Owens, Director of Financial Aid, Kentucky State University Beth Patrick, Chief Budget Officer, Morehead State University Tiffany Quinlan, KCTCS student regent (Hazard Community and Technical College) Carl Rollins, Executive Director, Kentucky Higher Education Assistance Authority Breana Smith, Student Government Association President, Kentucky State University Ashley Spalding, Research and Policy Associate, Kentucky Center for Economic Policy Leah Stewart, Director of Financial Aid and Scholarships, Northern Kentucky University Arnold Taylor, Committee on Equal Opportunities and Strategic Agenda Steering Committee member **Denise Trusty,** Financial Aid Director, Morehead State University Nimmi Wiggins, Student Financial Aid and Scholarships Director, University of Kentucky

## **ACADEMIC READINESS POLICY FORUM**

#### Introduction

The Academic Readiness Forum was held on April 9, 2015, at the Council on Postsecondary Education to gather feedback from key stakeholders to inform the 2016-2020 Strategic Agenda for Postsecondary and Adult Education. Twenty-nine individuals with expertise in academic readiness issues attended, including university provosts, academic outreach professionals, college advising and enrollment directors, adult education professionals, assessment coordinators, dual credit specialists, and others.

#### **Major Themes**

#### The need to improve core academic instruction in

K-12 schools. The academic success of college students in large part depends on the preparation they receive in high school. More work needs to be done to align classroom instruction and assessments with Kentucky's Core Academic Standards and ensure teaching is student-centered, project-based, and relevant to students' lives. The current use of standardized assessments encourages too many teachers to teach to the test-authentic assessments of student learning would be preferable. Interestingly, some of the most innovative instruction is occurring in mandated interventions for students who do not test college-ready; this is the kind of individualized, highquality teaching that all students should be receiving on a regular basis. Consider using videos to help model good teaching, as well as ongoing, high-quality, standaridized professional development offerings and one-on-one coaching that builds content knowledge and pedagogical skills. There are too many scatter-shot, one-day professional development activities that are inconsistent in quality. Career pathways are needed to attract and retain good teachers. Teacher preparation programs also need to improve the quality of their

graduates and provide more rigor and practical experiences earlier in the major.

#### The need to address non-cognitive factors that lead to college success. As noted in other forums, participants are finding that more and more students lack non-cognitive attributes and behaviors that lead to student success. Various surveys of student engagement show that high school and college students typically spend less than ten percent of their time studying outside of class, either due to a lack of study skills or academic rigor or both. Students tend to be less independent and lack self-efficacy, motivation, tenacity, leadership, problem-solving, cooperation, and organizational skills-skills that contribute not only to academic success but future career success. These skills must be assessed and addressed in the K-12 curriculum. The mandated Individual Learning Plan (ILP) might be a good vehicle for guiding the "soft skills" development of each student.

# The need to improve counseling and advising at the secondary and postsecondary levels.

Participants explored a range of shortcomings related to advising, from the administrative burdens K-12 guidance counselors face to the lack of academic and career advising at the college level. Guidance counselors can be extremely effective in helping build academic, social, and emotional skills, but they are saddled with too many disciplinary and assessment duties. The role and training of guidance counselors need to be revamped. Regarding postsecondary advising, many students wait too long to declare a major and do not develop an intentional, four-year plan to minimize timeto-degree and maximize undergraduate career development opportunities. There especially needs to be more advising around alternative degree pathways for students who are interested in vocational or technical careers and for students who begin at KCTCS and transfer to a four-year institution. High school dual



credit/enrollment programs with KCTCS have been successful in encouraging higher rates of college-going among students who may not see themselves as college material. However, high school dual credit teachers need to employ a more rigorous teaching style that more closely mimics a college environment.

# The need to increase success rates for developmental education students. Research shows

that students who are placed in traditional developmental education course sequences have dramatically lower rates of retention and completion. The Council has promoted new remediation models, such as placing developmental students in regular credit-bearing courses with enhanced academic supports, that are beginning to produce better outcomes for these students. However, not all faculty members and administrators are convinced their developmental education programs should be redesigned. More needs to be done to move developmental education redesign from the margins to the mainstream.

#### What's Working

Participants were asked to identify current statewide strategies that are having a positive impact on the academic readiness of students. Responses included:

#### For K-12 and postsecondary education:

- Postsecondary and secondary collaboration on college readiness standards and intervention strategies.
- Mandated intervention programming in high school for students who do not test college-ready on the ACT, which includes high school transition courses in math, English and reading.
- Alignment among K-12, adult education, and teacher preparation programs around the Kentucky Core Academic Standards.
- The development of degree pathways and 2 + 2 programs that help more students transition to baccalaureate programs.

- Summer bridge programs and other initiatives that address college readiness needs before students enroll in the fall.
- The involvement of CPE and postsecondary faculty in creating and delivering professional development focused on Senate Bill 1.
- Advance Kentucky, dual credit/enrollment programs, and early college initiatives that prepare more high school students for college—not just high-achieving students, but students who may not have set their sights on postsecondary education.
- TRIO and GEAR UP Kentucky, which provide college awareness activities and supports from grades 8-12 to low-income students. Consider adding similar services for elementary school students.

#### For adult education:

- The move from open-entry, open-exit to managed enrollment for Adult Basic Education/GED programs.
- Accelerated GED programs for students with high scores on the GED pre-test.
- Contextualized adult education programs that incorporate basic academic skill training with career and technical training (e.g., Accelerating Opportunity).
- Adult Education's adoption of the Kentucky Core Academic Standards, which has increased collaboration between Kentucky Adult Education, KDE, and CPE.
- Kentucky Adult Education is providing more robust professional development opportunities for both full- and part-time instructors.
- Kentucky Adult Education has provided good distance learning tools for local programs and students.

### What's Not Working

Participants brainstormed about current statewide strategies that have not been as effective in increasing academic readiness. Responses included:

#### For K-12 and postsecondary education:

- Individual Learning Plans (ILPs) need to be more robust in high school to monitor academic and non-cognitive skill development, as well as career readiness and exploration. If ILPs were incorporated into college admissions decisions, they might gain more weight.
- Current efforts to close college readiness achievement gaps among low-income and underrepresented minority students are not significantly moving the needle. Intervention services for at-risk, rural, or inner-city students are more often unavailable or ineffective.
- More needs to be done to align high school curricula and assessments to the Kentucky Core Academic Standards. Also, postsecondary institutions should review their programs to see how well they align with the Kentucky Core Academic Standards.
- Advising and counseling needs to be strengthened at the secondary and postsecondary levels. There is not enough parental, business and community support in schools.
- The CPE needs a permanent, full-time director assigned to college readiness initiatives.

#### For adult education:

- The new GED is more rigorous, so individuals are afraid to take the test. Instructors are focused more on moving students to a passing score (150) than an honors score (170).
- Adult education needs more training and resources to deal with students' significant learning disabilities and non-academic barriers to enrollment (e.g., childcare, work, transportation, addiction, homelessness, etc.).
- Many adult education instructors do not have strong enough content knowledge to prepare students for successful transitions to postsecondary education.

- Although adult education distance learning tools are available, many students lack broadband connectivity.
- Adult education marketing efforts need to be expanded to students and employers.

#### **Recommended Strategies**

- Expand efforts to redesign the delivery of developmental education courses.
- Mandate postsecondary involvement in the development of high school transition programs and maintain secondary and postsecondary collaborations and partnerships.
- Consider using a co-requisite developmental education model at the high school level to show struggling students that they can be successful in college with the right academic supports.
- Use student data and predictive analytics to inform the development and implementation of transition and intervention programming for K-12 students.
- Create more AP, IB, dual credit/enrollment and early college experiences for students, and ensure they are of uniform quality.
- Expand degree pathways, 2+2 transfer programs, and flexible degree programs for working adults.
- Expand the Accelerating Opportunities program model to more adults to help them gain basic academic skills and career training simultaneously.
- Increase the number of K-12 guidance counselors and provide more resources and support, including use of near peer, community, and career mentors. Use counselors to facilitate the development of "soft skills" and to identify students for intervention programming.
- Increase postsecondary education's presence and involvement in K-12 schools through nearpeer mentoring, college fairs, student speakers, career fairs, and other outreach activities.

Require college students to mentor high school students as part of a service requirement.

• Make better use of social media and digital technology to help students plan for college.

#### **Feedback on Metrics**

- Kentucky adult education needs a key metric to focus on transitions from GED programs to postsecondary education. The GED metric also needs to be revised.
- Participants would like to see more data on the educational outcomes (retention and graduation) of students in developmental education courses. They also would like to know how many developmental eduation students pass gatekeeper courses.
- Tracking student achievement by region would emphasize the large gaps between rural and metropolitan regions of the state and highlight

areas where the college-going culture needs to be strengthened.

• Kentucky needs a better metric to evaluate teacher effectiveness in both K-12 and adult education settings.

The Council on Postsecondary Education thanks the Lumina Foundation Strategy Labs for its financial support of these Strategic Agenda Policy Forums.

#### **Appendix A: Participants**

Kim Barber, CPE Committee on Equal Opportunities and Strategic Agenda Steering Committee member

Geoff Bailey, Executive Director, REACH

Sandy Bolster, Director, Basic Mathematics Program, Berea College

Gayle Box, Kentucky Adult Education

Dale Brown, Director of College and School Relations, Western Kentucky University

**Dan Connell**, Kentucky Association of Educational Opportunity Program Personnel (TRiO Ky) and Assistant Vice President for Adult Education and College Access, Morehead State University

Mason Dyer, Vice President for External Relations and Information, Association of Independent Kentucky Colleges and Universities

Donna Elder, National Center for Family Learning

Johnny Fleming, Mathematics Faculty, University of Pikeville

Dawn Hanzel, Director, Adult Literacy Education, Collaborative Center for Literacy Development

Randolph Hollingsworth, Assistant Provost, Undergraduate Education, University of Kentucky

George Hruby, Executive Director, Collaborative Center for Literacy Development

Sharon Hunter, Director, Strategic Enrollment Management, Western Kentucky University

Daniel McGee, Executive Director, Kentucky Center for Mathematics

Patrick Moynahan, Vice Provost, Northern Kentucky University

Shirley Nelson, University of Pikeville

Amy Patterson, Office of Next Generation Learning, Kentucky Department of Education

**April Pieper,** Branch Manager, Differentiated Learning, Office of Next Generation Learning, Kentucky Department of Education

Pamela Petty, Director, Western Kentucky University Center for Literacy

Eve Profitt, Director, P20 Innovation, University of Kentucky

Mike Rosenberg, Gateway Community and Technical College

Benton Shirey, Director, University Advising, Eastern Kentucky University

Jennifer Stansbury-Koenig, Kentucky Partnership Academy Director, Northern Kentucky University Lisa Stephenson, Dual Credit Director, West Kentucky Community and Technical College Daniel Super, KY Partnership Academy Director, Western Kentucky University Mary Gwen Wheeler, Executive Director, Louisville's 55,000 Degrees Diane Williams, Director, Learning Assistance Programs, Northern Kentucky University Kathy Williams, Director, Academic Readiness & Testing, Eastern Kentucky University Ben Withers, Associate Provost, Undergraduate Education, University of Kentucky

## **RESEARCH & INNOVATION FORUM**

#### Introduction

The Research and Innovation Policy Forum was held on April 27, 2015, at the Council on Postsecondary Education to gather feedback from key stakeholders to inform the 2016-2020 Strategic Agenda for Postsecondary and Adult Education. Twenty-four individuals with expertise in research issues attended, including representatives from the Kentucky Science and Technology Corporation, vice presidents for research, university sponsored program directors, representatives from the Kentucky Consortium of Undergraduate Research, professional engineers, and others.

### **Major Themes**

The need to revitalize Bucks for Brains. Kentucky's Endowment Match Program, commonly known as "Bucks for Brains," was established in 1998 to attract top researchers to Kentucky's public unversities. State dollars invested in the program were matched dollarfor-dollar with institutional, foundation, and philanthropic funds, which enabled universities to hire nationally competitive faculty and secure more federal research funding. Unfortunately, due to state budget reductions, there has not been an appropriation for "Bucks for Brains" since the 2008-10 biennium. The universities strongly feel that the state should reinvest in this program, both for research unversities and for comprehensive universities (through the Regional University Excellence Fund).

#### The need to foster a more entrepreneurial culture on campus generally and among university researchers in particular. Recruiting major employers to locate their operations in Kentucky is a big part of

Kentucky's economic development strategy, but it is not the only part. Training Kentuckians to start and manage their own businesses is a viable job creation strategy as

well. Entrepreneurial training should begin as early as high school through business plan competitions and other hands-on activities. In college, students should receive skills and training to develop an entrepreneurial mindset, meaning that they are innovative, able to identify business opportunities, and are not averse to risk. K-12 teachers and postsecondary faculty may need some professional development in this area—they can't be expected to train future entrepreneurs if they are not entrepreneurial themselves. Many university researchers are in a position to commercialize their research, but lack the entrepreneurial training and mindset to take a discovery to the marketplace. More should be done to help researchers develop research that could generate revenue for the university and to guide them through the commericialization process.

DEGREES

The need to revise promotion and tenure policies to value faculty contributions in entrepreneurship and undergraduate research. The single biggest driver of faculty behavior is the promotion and tenure policies of our universities. Understandably, faculty members are reluctant to take on obligations that are not rewarded in tenure and promotion processes, however much they contribute to student success or the welfare of the institution or state. Faculty members should get release time or reduced teaching loads for activities like supervising undergraduate research assistants or projects, commercializing research, licensing a product, or starting a company. These activities should count toward promotion and tenure, as well as publications and service.

#### What's Working

Participants were asked to identify current statewide strategies that are having a positive impact on research, innovation and entrepreneurship. Responses included:

• The Kentucky Science and Engineering Foundation (KSEF), which invests in research and development

activities to promote new product development and commercialization, and to advance new ideas and technologies with the potential to promote economic growth.

- The Kentucky SBIR/STTR program, a KSEF initiative that funds the development of federal Phase I and Phase II proposals for Kentucky-based small business innovation research (SBIR) and small business technology transfer research (STTR). KSEF also administers a statewide SBIR/STTR matching funds program, which provides grants for additional activities complementary to federal Phase I or Phase II awards.
- The Kentucky Enterprise Fund (KEF), a statesponsored, venture capital-like fund that invests in Kentucky-based seed and early-stage technology companies.
- Kentucky EPSCoR, which stimulates sustainable improvements in the Commonwealth's research and development capacity and advances science and engineering capabilities for discovery, innovation, and knowledge-based prosperity.
- Venture Connectors, an incorporated, non-profit organization that brings entrepreneurs and investors together in a professional but relaxed setting. The organization facilitates the expansion of business and commercial investment activities in the Kentuckiana region.
- Bucks for Brains, which, when funded, generated large investments in basic and applied research and attracted top researchers and National Science Foundation funding to the state.
- The statewide push to increase the number of STEM+H degrees.
- The Council's efforts to regularly convene chief research officers to share strategies and discuss potential collaborations.
- The University of Louisville's research/business partnership called FirstBuild. FirstBuild is a community of engineers, scientists, fabricators, designers and enthusiasts that prototype, iterate and refine existing GE products, as well as build and commercialize various new designs. At the

edge of the UofL campus, the FirstBuild Micro Factory allows students, engineers, and the larger community to co-create the next generation of smart appliances in an atmosphere of research and development.

- The technology transfer offices and resources at the University of Louisville and the University of Kentucky.
- The creation and support of small businesses, which is gaining momentum in Kentucky.

### What's Not Working

Participants brainstormed about current statewide strategies that have not been as effective in increasing research, innovation and entrepreneurship. Responses included:

- There is no strategic communications and marketing plan to highlight the return on investment for university research and development.
- There is not enough collaboration and conversation with Kentucky's economic development leaders to identify and build on Kentucky's current research strengths. More should be done regionally to align research expertise with economic needs.
- There is not enough collaboration and conversation with potential investors and business and industry leaders to identify marketable research opportunities for universities. While some research is purely for research's sake, commercialization opportunities are lost due to a lack of communication between these parties.
- Faculty members are often unaware of commercialization opportunities and do not know enough about technology transfer, intellectual property rights or patent applications to move forward. Faculty members need more training and education about the process. Research faculty at comprehensive universities need

greater access to the technology transfer resources and expertise available at UK and UofL.

- Kentucky needs to be more entrepreneurial; research faculty and economic development leaders should pursue more high-risk/high-reward strategies without fear of failure. This is the only way Kentucky will transform itself from an essentially manufacturing economy to a knowledge-based economy.
- The regional stewardship initiative spearheaded by the Council lost momentum when funding was no longer earmarked for these programs. There is a lack of clarity around the Council's role in regional stewardship, as well as its priorities.
- Universities generally are not nimble when dealing with the private sector. Universities need to streamline bureaucratic processes when dealing with business and industry.
- Students are not exposed to enough undergraduate research opportunities, internships and practical career experiences during college.

### **Recommended Strategies**

- Create a statewide research clearinghouse that would enable investors, businesses, and industries to connect with university researchers engaged in projects with commercialization potential. This database would promote technology transfer and help university researchers connect with researchers at other institutions who are working on similar projects and ideas. It could also include venture capital opportunities for research.
- Identify subject matter experts that could advise university researchers on industry problems that need to be addressed. This may increase the marketability of research.
- Facilitate and replicate industry partnerships like UofL's FirstBuild that provide internships and opportunities for student researchers to apply their knowledge to an industry setting.

- Implement a public awareness and advocacy campaign to articulate the value of basic and applied research and convince the General Assembly that research investments are vital to Kentucky's economic growth and development. Advocates should include not only higher education institutions, but the Kentucky Manufacturers Association, the Kentucky Chamber of Commerce, and other key business and industry partners. As one participant stated, "We need to tell a more compelling story."
- Create the Kentucky D (discovery) prize, an annual competition to award a research team \$1 million to pursue research aimed at solving a critical challenge or problem in Kentucky. This would shine a light on the value of research and be a great publicity tool.
- Restructure tenure and promotion policies to promote entrepreneurial and research activities among faculty.
- Require every undergraduate student to engage in research or complete a capstone project as a condition of graduation.
- Promote greater collaboration among research and comprehensive universities to provide technology transfer assistance to faculty members who lack the support of a technology transfer office. Perhaps UK and UofL could provide legal advice on intellectual property law and assist with patent applications for a percentage of future profits.
- Encourage public universities to collaborate with other institutions on similar research projects.
- Consider providing state seed money or matching grant funds for large federal grant programs or key faculty hires.

### **Feedback on Metrics**

- The number of doctoral degrees awarded annually could be a metric to gauge Kentucky's future research capacity.
- The current metric on annual STEM+H degrees is good, but it needs to focus more narrowly on the

degrees that will truly enhance the state's research capacity and economic growth. We may want to use a measure like degrees awarded per 1,000. One participant suggested we track the employment outcomes of STEM+H graduates to determine their value in the marketplace.

- The number of peer-reviewed faculty publications could be a measure of research productivity, as well as federal research grants/funding. Consider comparing extramural research funding to benchmark states.
- In general, Kentucky should benchmark our progress against competitor states and institutions more often, and borrow and adapt strategies that have worked well in other places.
- Consider a metric to communicate the economic impact of research (e.g., number of business start-ups, company spin-offs, patent applications, patents issued, licenses to industry, and licensure revenue).
- Consider a metric that compares the state's investment in a student's undergraduate

education versus the economic return to the state.

• When developing metrics, remember that both quantitiative and qualitative measures are important.

The Council on Postsecondary Education thanks the Lumina Foundation Strategy Labs for its financial support of these Strategic Agenda Policy Forums.

#### **Appendix A: Participants**

Ty Adams, Venture Connectors Board of Directors, Adams: Kincaid Design

Gus Benson, Sponsored Program Director, Eastern Kentucky University

Kim Carter, Executive Director, Office of Sponsored Programs, University of Kentucky

Lisa Cassis, Vice President for Research, University of Kentucky

Adam Caswell, Vice President of Public Affairs, Northern Kentucky Chamber of Commerce

Pamela Feldhoff, Kentucky Consortium of Undergraduate Research, University of Louisville

Renee Fister, Senior Presidential Advisor for Strategic Initiatives, Murray State University

Paula Fowler, Executive Director, Danville Chamber of Commerce

**Mahendra Jain,** Senior Vice President and KSEF Executive Director, Kentucky Science and Technology Corporation

Kris Kimel, President, Kentucky Science and Technology Corporation

Lou Lenzi, Industrial Design Director, General Electric

**Angie Martin,** Chief Budget Officer, University of Kentucky, & member of the CPE Strategic Agenda Steering Committee

Haley McCoy, Executive Advisor, Community and Economic Development, Kentucky Science and Technology Corporation

Dan O'Hair, Dean, College of Communication, University of Kentucky

Bill Pierce, Vice President of Research and Innovation, University of Louisville

Neville Pinto, Engineering Dean, University of Louisville

Jerry Pogatshnik, Dean of the Graduate School, Eastern Kentucky University

Jody Cofer Randall, Kentucky Consortium of Undergraduate Research, Murray State University

**Robert Staat,** Professor of Microbiology, University of Louisville, & member of the CPE Strategic Agenda Steering Committee and Committee on Equal Opportunities

Nathan Vanderford, Assistant Dean, Academic Development, College of Medicine, University of Kentucky

John Walz, Engineering Dean, University of Kentucky

George Ward, Executive Director, Coldstream Research Campus

Christina Whitfield, Vice Chancellor for Research and Analysis, KCTCS

Sherrill Zimmerman, CPE member and Chair, CPE Strategic Agenda Steering Committee

## **STUDENT SUCCESS POLICY FORUM**

#### Introduction

The Student Success Forum was held on April 29, 2015, at the Council on Postsecondary Education to gather feedback from key stakeholders to inform the 2016-2020 Strategic Agenda for Postsecondary and Adult Education. Nineteen individuals with expertise in student success issues attended, including university provosts, enrollment managers, assessment coordinators, retention specialists, and others.

#### **Major Themes**

The need to improve student motivation, engagement and maturity. As noted in other forums, participants are finding that more and more students lack non-cognitive attributes and behaviors that lead to student success. Participants expressed dismay that many college students, even if academically prepared, lack motivation, study skills, independence, maturity, and engagement in their own academic careers. There is a need to develop critical thinking and problemsolving skills in students, perhaps through service learning, internships, independent study, capstone projects, undergraduate research, and other activities designed to increase student engagement. These engagement activities could be built into a student's graduation plan, so there is an intentional effort to enrich the undergraduate experience.

The need to improve advising at the secondary and postsecondary levels. The need for better, more individualized advising was a common refrain throughout the day. Too often student support services are driven by individual college and unit needs rather than the students' unique needs and circumstances. Atrisk students may need more intensive advising services dealing not only with academic concerns, but with social, emotional, financial, and cultural matters. For example, it may be helpful to pair first-generation

Hispanic students with first-generation Hispanic advisors, and to provide opportunities for both individual and cohort-based interactions. Participants stressed that online students should be offered the same access to the entire range of advising services as traditional students (academic advising, tutoring, writing center assistance, career services, etc.), even if these services are delivered via a technology like video chat. Much more communication and coordination is needed between KCTCS and the public universities to advise students who are planning to transfer or who are good candidates for a transfer program. Also, students need help deciding on a major that matches their interests and abilities, as well as assistance if they decide to change majors. Faculty members often are reluctant to play a bigger role in counseling and advising, even though they are usually the individuals who have the most contact with students. Both faculty and staff need to see advising and coaching as part of their role and employ empathy in understanding the burdens and challenges many students face. Some participants expressed concern that the student support services campuses are currently providing are not being assessed to determine their effectiveness. At the same time, there are many research-based advising practices that have been proven effective, so campuses may not need to re-invent the wheel.

The lack of resources to implement high-impact practices and other reforms. Participants praised the Council for identifying research-based, high-impact practices (like co-requisite models of developmental education) that campuses can implement to increase student success. Unfortunately, budget constraints have made it difficult for campuses to undertake reforms. Seed money and mini-grants awarded by the Council to implement innovative practices and strategies have been very helpful in the past. More funding is needed to accelerate improvement.



#### What's Working

Participants were asked to identify current statewide strategies that are having a positive impact on student success. Responses included:

- The University of the Mountains puts public, private, and KCTCS services under one roof to provide seamless postsecondary education opportunities for students.
- Advance Kentucky, dual credit/enrollment programs, and early college initiatives prepare more high school students for college and may reduce costs.
- The development of degree pathways, 2 + 2 programs, transfer partnerships and agreements, and resources like KnowHow2Transfer.org help students transition to baccalaureate programs.
- Most institutions have reduced the number of credits needed to graduate from a bachelor's degree program (to 120 hours).
- The 15 to Finish campaign has raised awareness of the benefits of taking 15 credit hours a semester, especially for traditional undergraduate students.
- Project Graduate has helped increase the number of adults who are coming back to college to complete a degree.
- The Council's new program review process is aimed at promoting academic quality and includes some student employment outcomes.
- The Student Success Summit has been an effective tool for bringing campus administrators and student services staff together to discuss how to improve student outcomes.
- Summer bridge programs and other initiatives that address college readiness needs before students enroll in the fall are lowering developmental education rates.
- Accelerating Opportunity has helped adult education students gain basic skills and career training and credentials simultaneously.
- Learn on Demand, Commonwealth College, and other non-traditional delivery models show

promise of attracting more adults to postsecondary education.

#### What's Not Working

Participants brainstormed about current statewide strategies that have not been as effective in increasing student success. Responses included:

- Retention and graduation rates have been fairly flat over the last five years in Kentucky and remain below the national average despite increased efforts and focus.
- Current efforts to close graduation rate gaps among low-income and underrepresented minority students are not significantly improving performance.
- Advising and counseling needs to be strengthened at the secondary and postsecondary levels.
   Budget cuts have resulted in reduced staffing in key areas. Faculty members need to step up their commitment to and involvement in student advising and mentoring. Institutions need to reallocate dollars to student services.
- Outdated institutional policies and practices contribute to students' difficulty in navigating the campus bureaucracy. Institutions need to streamline, centralize, and modernize bureaucratic processes.
- While institutional transfer agreements are working, there needs to be further improvement in statewide transfer agreements.
- Institutions must work harder to accommodate adult students through credit for prior learning, competency-based instruction, and more flexible delivery models.
- College is becoming unaffordable for too many students.
- The Student Success Summit has not attracted enough participation and support from faculty members.
- Statewide and institution diversity plans are not integrated into the Strategic Agenda's objectives, strategies, and metrics.

• Campuses have not received any helpful feedback from CPE staff on academic program review.

### **Recommended Strategies**

- Expand efforts to redesign the delivery of developmental education courses to reduce their duration and cost. This may include increasing the number of summer bridge programs, discounting tuition for developmental courses, or enrolling developmental education students in creditbearing courses with enhanced supports.
- Increase 2-year to 4-year transfer by providing more degree pathways and student incentives. These could include discounting KCTCS tuition for transfer students and/or allowing them to enroll in a four-year institution at the KCTCS rate if they enter with an associate degree.
- Provide more individualized and cohort-based student support services for at-risk students, such as minority students, military veterans, firstgeneration students, low-income students, undocumented students, and others.
- Expand degree pathways, 2+2 transfer programs, and flexible degree programs for working adults, including online, competency-based programs. Embed wraparound student services into these models.
- Improve career development services on campus and expand business partnerships to provide more internships, job shadowing, and other career training opportunities.
- Strengthen efforts to recruit, train, and hire more diverse educators at the secondary and postsecondary levels.
- Create more AP, IB, dual credit/enrollment and early college experiences for students and ensure they are of uniform quality.
- Expand the Accelerating Opportunities program model to more adults to help them gain basic academic skills and career training simultaneously.
- Implement a statewide initiative aimed at attracting and retaining more high-performing

students into our colleges and universities, perhaps by increasing merit scholarships or institutional reputations.

- Implement reverse transfer programs that allow four-year undergraduate students who are planning to drop out to transfer credits to KCTCS and, if eligible, earn an associate degree.
- Increase financial aid opportunities for GED students, low-income students, adult students, middle class students who are not eligible for need-based aid, and other populations for which college is not as affordable.
- Implement an advocacy campaign to persuade the General Assembly to re-invest in higher education.

### **Feedback on Metrics**

- The Council needs a better completion metric; the current six-year graduation rate only captures first-time, full-time undergraduate students who finish within six years and omits transfer students, part-time students, and students who take longer than six years to graduate.
- There is not enough granular data available to track student retention and progression.
   Retention should be tracked every year.
- The Council does a good job of tracking students who enter college with developmental education needs, but institutions would like to know what happens to these students once they enter creditbearing coursework. How many of these students complete a degree?
- If the Council adopts a measure of academic quality, it should not be limited to national rankings or a standardized assessment like the CLA. An academic quality metric should incorporate student portfolios and other authentic assessments and might include the implementation of high-impact practices on campus.
- Consider a metric to track the success of students who enter college from high school dual credit

programs. Is dual credit improving student outcomes?

- Consider a metric to better understand the impact of credit for prior learning on student success.
- The Council used to have a metric focused on student engagement (NSSE results). Consider incorporating a new metric to measure student engagement (not necessarily quantitative data; consider qualitative data sources as well).
- When considering metrics for institutional diversity plans, think about how to promote and measure cultural competency initiatives on campus.
- Some campuses feel the Council needs a better system to validate institutional results on key performance metrics.

The Council on Postsecondary Education thanks the Lumina Foundation Strategy Labs for its financial support of these Strategic Agenda Policy Forums.

#### **Appendix A: Participants**

Kim Barber, CPE Committee on Equal Opportunities and Strategic Agenda Steering Committee member Dale Billingsly, Vice Provost, Undergraduate Affairs and Enrollment Management, University of Louisville Laurie Carter, Executive Vice President of Student Success, Eastern Kentucky University Deborah Cox, Academic Affairs, Madisonville Community College **Mason Dyer**, Vice President for External Relations and Information, Association of Independent Kentucky **Colleges and Universities Paula Jones,** Program Director, Adult Education, Eastern Kentucky University Michael Krause, Director of Student Enrollment and Engagement, Kentucky Community and Technical College System James Mantooth, Director of Retention Services, Murray State University **Daniel McGee**, Executive Director, Kentucky Center for Mathematics Jay Morgan, Provost and Vice President of Academic Affairs, Murray State University J. Patrick Moynahan, Vice Provost, Northern Kentucky University Gene Palka, Associate Vice President for Student Success, Eastern Kentucky University Jill Ratliff, Assistant Vice President of Academic Affairs, Morehead State University Tara Rose, Director, Office of Assessment, University of Kentucky Mike Shanks, Director, Transfer Center, University of Kentucky Janna Vice, Provost and Vice President of Academic Affairs, Eastern Kentucky University Kelley Wezner, Director of Institutional Assessment, Eastern Kentucky University Peggy Whaley, Coordinator of FYE Center for Academic Success, Murray State University **Ben Withers,** Associate Provost, Undergraduate Education, University of Kentucky

#### Introduction

A policy forum focused on workforce issues was held on May 4, 2015, at the Kentucky Council on Postsecondary Education to gather feedback from key stakeholders to inform the 2016-2020 Strategic Agenda for Postsecondary and Adult Education. Twenty-three educators and government officials with expertise in workforce issues attended, including representatives from the Labor Cabinet, the Education and Workforce Cabinet, the Economic Development Cabinet, campus career and development offices and other college leaders, the Center for Economic Policy, and the Kentucky Center for Education and Workforce Statistics. Additional conversations will be held with employers to gather feedback.

#### **Major Themes**

# Greater communication and shared strategies are needed between the higher education and

**business communities.** This was a prominent theme and came up in virtually every conversation throughout the day. While many participants agreed that there are efforts (some very successful) to bring the employer voice to campus, most agreed that more needs to be done to create a meaningful and sustained dialogue between employers and educators about workforce needs, skills development, and ways to work more closely to achieve common goals. Participants suggested that regional and state-level conversations between educators and employers were needed, as well as campus-based discussions.

# College graduates need interpersonal and life skills as well as academic training to be successful

**in the workplace.** While academic programs and jobspecific training are essential for certain careers, the group stressed the importance of other skills and qualities critical to workplace success, including leadership, teamwork, critical thinking, problem solving, foundational skills (reading, writing, math and technology), cultural competence, flexibility, selfmanagement, entrepreneurial and innovative thinking, integrity, empathy, and ethical behavior. While the group noted that campuses cannot be expected to instill all of these skills and qualities in their students, there are opportunities to develop them through a variety of campus programs and activities, including service learning programs, internships and co-ops, and more intentional advising about the importance of these skills in the workplace.

#### Experiential or project-based learning should be built into all higher education programs to help prepare students for the workplace. This

recommendation repeatedly surfaced as an essential strategy for improving career readiness and helping students transition from the classroom to the workplace. The group stressed not only the importance of internships, clinical activities, co-ops and other workplace learning opportunities, but hands-on and applied learning through team activities, undergraduate research, and classroom and community-based projects. Participants noted that experiential learning was particularly important in humanities disciplines where it has not traditionally been part of the curriculum. Related to this, participants suggested that professional development was needed to help faculty incorporate more applied learning opportunities into the curriculum and build relationships with employers.

# Career planning/advising should begin earlier for students, and should play a more central role for

**campuses.** While the group agreed that the purpose of higher education was not solely to prepare students for careers, there was general consensus that more can and should be done to help students navigate the transition from postsecondary education to the workplace, including earlier career planning for students and a more holistic approach on campus to career services. As one participant noted, being liberally educated **and** well prepared to enter the workforce are not



diametrically opposed. Several people suggested that campuses needed to be more intentional about career development activities, and that they should be interwoven throughout the curricula and academic advising activities.

#### Campuses should modify programs and delivery options to respond to the needs of adult learners and changing campus demographics. Forum

participants agreed that evolving workforce needs and changing campus demographics provide opportunities for campuses to rethink some of their programs and the ways they are delivered. Adult students—who often are balancing family, work and school commitments—can benefit from non-traditional academic options like competency-based programs linked to specific workforce demands that allow them to advance at their own pace and in their own environment. The group noted that quality certifications often are a benefit to employers and could supplement traditional academic programs. Certificate programs are particularly beneficial when they are stackable (can be applied to further credentials) and are developed in partnership with the employer community.

#### **Issues and Recommendations**

Participants were asked to respond to several broad questions to help identify key issues, challenges and recommendations for further consideration.

## How can employers help students prepare for the workforce?

- Provide more co-ops, internships and externships.
  Paid internships are particularly valuable for students.
- Offer time and expertise to campus leaders through service on advisory boards or through regular meetings to identify and help develop needed programs and career pathways.
- Provide regular feedback to campuses about program quality and the career readiness of recent graduates.

- Work with career services offices to connect with students through recruitment fairs and campusbased interviews.
- Participate in regional and state-level discussions and planning sessions to improve the talent pipeline.
- Serve (or encourage employees to serve) as mentors to help students develop their skills and knowledge about specific careers.
- Engage with faculty to help build their understanding of specific workplace needs and skill sets.

## How can campuses help students better prepare for the workforce?

- Create incentives for faculty to engage in the career development of students, develop relationships with employers and participate in externships.
- Provide more dual credit opportunities in high school leading to stackable credentials needed in the workplace.
- Be more intentional and systematic with students about career planning early in their programs, and continue that conversation throughout their time in postsecondary education (e.g., four-year plans, clearly articulated career pathways).
- Provide experiential/applied learning opportunities across the curriculum.
- Use tools like Focus Explorer (a tool the Workforce Cabinet is developing) to match skills to jobs and students with employers.
- Participate in state and regional conversations to develop sector-based strategies and industry partnerships.
- Where appropriate, develop competency-based programs aligned with workforce needs and recognize credit for prior learning.
- Strengthen career development offices and link their work to the larger goals and objectives of the campus.
- Establish meaningful employer advisory boards to gather regular input and engage employers in program development and evaluation.
- Develop specific strategies for adult students who need specific and early career advising.

# What are the barriers for campuses and employers in implementing these strategies?

- Employers often are hesitant to take on interns due to cost and investment of time.
- "The illusion of inclusion." Employers are invited the table but sometimes postsecondary education is not responsive to their input.
- There sometimes is a perception that it is difficult to get interns and co-op students, especially for smaller employers, or employers simply are not aware of opportunities.
- Campus silos that inhibit communication with employers and the development of broad strategies to improve career services for students. There is not a holistic approach to career development on some campuses.
- Lack of resources, time and personnel.
- Tenure and reward policies discourage faculty from engaging with employers and taking on extra responsibilities in this area.
- The average Kentuckian (and employer) is intimidated by the university system. Even lack of parking on campus can be a barrier to employer engagement.
- Campuses often do not recognize that lack of student confidence is a barrier to their success. All students need more advising and hand-holding. Universities should bring a whole team of supporters together to help students.
- Many faculty members have never left the education environment. They do not understand the business environment.

## How can postsecondary education better align degree production with workforce needs?

- Review the state's economic development priorities and assess program alignment (healthcare, business services, energy, transportation, and advanced manufacturing).
- Gather employer input through ongoing industry sector conversations and strategy development.

- Use business intelligence tools (Burning Glass, etc.) with students and faculty that identify current and emerging workforce demands.
- Support industry-recognized credentials and certificates
- Develop/improve relationships with local workforce investment boards.
- Invest in career advising tools linked to current market demands.
- Pair liberal-arts degrees with training/certifications (i.e. psychology degree with mediation certification).
- Making sure credentials are stackable and can lead to further education/training.
- Help students understand the financial realities of career choices. One participant noted that some postsecondary certification programs lead to jobs that don't pay a living wage.
- Help students understand the changing nature of the workforce. One participant noted that half of all jobs soon will be 1099s (contract workers). Students need to be prepared to market themselves in this environment.

## How can postsecondary education improve the career development function of campuses?

- Make this a priority of the campus administration and a key strategy for student success.
- Career development needs to be a shared responsibility across campus.
- Invest more resources in career development.
- Incorporate career development across the curriculum.
- Communicate often with professional associations to understand workplace needs.
- Develop a career development plan for students their freshman year and monitor regularly.

#### How can we better communicate the value of humanities/liberal arts degrees to employers and help these students market themselves?

- Several participants noted that many employers want more well-rounded individuals rather than specific majors.
- Higher education should include more internships and project-based learning into liberal arts degrees to increase their value and visibility. Students could talk about these experiences on resumes and in interviews.
- Engage alumni who graduated with liberal arts degrees to help mentor students about career opportunities.
- National data show that many liberal arts majors are entrepreneurs. Campuses should consider paring liberal arts training with entrepreneurship skills.
- Make it easier for students to double major or build in career emphases or certifications to pair with liberal arts degrees.

#### How can we measure employment outcomes or employer satisfaction? Should these be included as metrics in the next strategic agenda?

 There was a lot of discussion about developing effective, usable metrics in this policy area.
 Participants noted that there a national dialogue going on right now about this issue, which recognizes the complexity of measures in this area.

- Among the questions that arose were: Do you measure any employment? Employment in specific fields? What about students working out-of-state? How do we gather these data without broad interstate agreements?
- It was suggested that the new strategic agenda include a charge to develop appropriate employment measures rather than include a lessthan-satisfactory metric. There was a general consensus that the country is in the early days of developing these metrics.
- Kentucky has the capacity through KCEWS to get employment outcomes through wage and UI data; however, there is no consensus on using these data to develop a performance metric.
- Employer surveys/satisfaction is a harder nut to crack. Sometimes employers fear being critical of institutions.
- There was a question about measuring the number or percent of students who have an applied learning experience (internships, etc.). Some noted that the metric would have to be very broad in its definition because many different types of experiential learning could be captured. It also would be very hard to measure and track.
- Several participants recommended reviewing surveys from the NACE (National Association of Colleges and Employers) survey—statewide participation.

The Council on Postsecondary Education thanks the Lumina Foundation Strategy Labs for its financial support of these Strategic Agenda Policy Forums.

#### **Appendix A: Participants**

Kate Akers, Interim Director, Kentucky Center on Workforce and Education Statistics

Karen Badger, Associate Professor, Director of Undergraduate Studies, Associate Dean for Student and Academic Affairs, University of Kentucky

Josh Benton, Executive Director, Bluegrass State Skills Corporation

Christopher Bollinger, Director, Center for Business and Economic Research, University of Kentucky

Beth Brinly, Deputy Secretary, Kentucky Cabinet for Education and Workforce Development

Ron Crouch, Director of Research Statistics, Office of Employment and Training

Robert Curry, Executive Director, Work Ready Communities

Virginia Denny, Director, Training and Organizational Development, Delphi Center, University of Louisville

Mike Donta, Deputy Commissioner, Department of Workplace Standards, KY Labor Cabinet

Larry Ferguson, Vice Chancellor for Economic Development, Kentucky Community and Technical College System

Bill Froude, Director, Career Services, Northern Kentucky University

Bob Goldstein, Vice Provost, Institutional Effectiveness & Analytics, University of Louisville

Janet Harrah, Senior Director, Center for Economic Analysis & Development, Northern Kentucky University

Julia Hawkins, Director of Career Services, Morehead State University

Bob Jackson, President, Murray State University Foundation

Brad Kissell, Director, Adult Learner Services, Western Kentucky University

Darryl McGaha, Cumberlands Workforce Investment Board

Gladys Miller, Director, Center for Career and Co-op Education, Eastern Kentucky University

Manoj Shanker, Economist, Office of Employment and Training

Ashley Spalding, Research & Policy Associate, Kentucky Center for Economic Policy

Tim Todd, Dean, College of Business, Murray State University

Mary Gwen Wheeler, Executive Director, 55,000 Degrees

Sherrill Zimmerman, Chair, CPE Strategic Agenda Steering Committee and CPE Board Member